
APPLICATION NO.	P08/W0808
APPLICATION TYPE	FULL PLANNING PERMISSION
REGISTERED	23.07.08
PARISH	CHOLSEY
WARD MEMBER(S)	Mrs P Dawe
APPLICANT	Mr & Mrs T Wheeler
SITE	Montclair 29 Winterbrook, Wallingford
PROPOSAL	Two storey extension and alterations
AMENDMENTS	None
GRID REFERENCE	460605/188406
OFFICER	Miss G Napier

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 This application has been referred to the Planning Committee at the request of the local member, Councillor Pat Dawe.
- 1.2 The site, Montclair, is located within an historic part of Winterbrook to the south of the centre of Wallingford. It is a detached two storey dwelling with some living accommodation within the roof space and is constructed from brick with a slate tile roof. There is an existing single storey flat roof extension to the west (front) elevation and a single storey pitched roof projection to the east (rear) elevation.
- 1.3 The property lies within an extensive plot measuring some 3,182 sq. m and is surrounded by a number of listed buildings. There is a line of mature trees located directly to the rear (north) of the property on the neighbours side.
- 1.4 The site is identified on the Ordnance Survey extract **attached** at Appendix 1.

2.0 PROPOSAL

- 2.1 The application seeks full planning permission for the erection of a two storey extension and alterations to the existing property. The flat roof extension is to be demolished and to the rear the single storey element is to be replaced by a two storey extension which will create an 'L' shaped plan form.
- 2.2 The two storey extension would project from the east (rear) elevation and would continue from the existing ridge line. The extension would also project to the south creating an 'L' shaped footprint and would cut across part of the principal (south) elevation. The two storey extension has an asymmetric roof with dormer windows and a bay window to the east elevation. A new pitched roof porch is to be added to the south elevation and a number of internal alterations are proposed including the relocation of the staircase.
- 2.3 The extensions provide a fourth bedroom and three en-suite bathrooms, a bathroom at first floor level, a relocated lounge and larger kitchen.
- 2.4 A copy of the submitted plans and the Design and Access Statement are **attached** at Appendix 2.

3.0 CONSULTATIONS & REPRESENTATIONS

- 3.1 Parish Council No objection
- Neighbour Letters Objector (1) The proposal is for a substantial extension that will at least double the size of the existing structure. The existing cottage is of historic character in a semi-rural setting and surrounded by historic buildings on at least 3 sides. The proposed extensions will 'adversely affect the historic setting of the immediate vicinity'. The increase in built form along the boundary with Winterbrook House will adversely affect views from Winterbrook House and light levels. Proposed windows on rear elevation will affect privacy at Winterbrook House.
- Supporter (2) The proposed extensions will be a 'real improvement'.
- The property has always been an eyesore and until recently was in a poor state of repair. The proposed drawings are impressive as they do not interfere with any neighbours. The plans are positive and should be encouraged.
- Forestry Officer Awaiting comments
- Countryside Officer No impact on protected species.

4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

- 4.1 None

5.0 POLICY & GUIDANCE

- 5.1 Adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan Policies (SOLP 2011):
G6 – Promoting good design
D1 – Good design and local distinctiveness
CON5 – Setting of listed buildings
H13 – Extensions to dwellings

South Oxfordshire Design Guide.

6.0 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 6.1 **The main issues to consider with this application are:**
- **Design and scale**
 - **Impact on setting of surrounding listed buildings**
 - **Impact on neighbours**
 - **Parking and amenity**

6.2 **Design and scale.** The property is modest in character with a simple linear form and symmetrical openings. The volume of the existing dwelling is some 373 cubic metres and with the extensions the volume would increase to some 810 cubic metres, an increase of some 46%.

The plot is extensive and is capable of accommodating a much larger dwelling although given the modest scale of the existing dwelling, any extension should be subservient if the existing character is to be retained.

The proposed 'L' shaped extension would upset the simple linear plan form of the original property and it does not relate to the modest scale of the existing building in that the depth of the cottage is some 5.6 metres whilst the depth of the proposed extension is some 7.6 metres.

The south facing elevation is the principal elevation and is prominent from the road. The elevation is symmetrical and extremely simple in its appearance comprising of the front door and four identical windows which are positioned around the off- centre entrance door. The proposed two storey extension would cut across part of this principal elevation, upsetting the symmetry and would present a very deep, blank gable end to the road.

The ridge of the extension extends from the existing ridge with no set down or set back. This will result in an awkward junction between old and new due to mis-matching materials as it is unlikely that a perfect match would be found.

There are minimal openings within the original building and they are of a regular size and spacing with an arched soldier course detail above. The proposed new openings vary in size, are irregular in their positioning and at first floor are located directly beneath the eaves. Two dormer windows are also proposed as is a large oval 'feature' window and a bay, all to the east elevation. The new openings do not therefore respect the traditional style or format of the existing windows.

Your officers consider that the extension does not have regard to the existing cottage in terms of its scale, form or design detailing and features and would overwhelm the cottage to the detriment of its modest and simple character contrary to Policies G6 and H13 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan and to Section 6 of the South Oxfordshire Design Guide.

6.3 **Impact on setting of surrounding listed buildings.** Montclair is surrounded by a number of listed buildings including Winterbrook House to the north and Winterbrook Lodge and The Lawns to the west.

The area around the application site is characterised by large properties on wide plots and there are wide open spaces between the dwellings. As a result of these open spaces and the presence of a large number of mature trees and vegetation, the area is semi-rural in character.

Although not listed itself, Montclair is an aesthetically pleasing building with much charm and character owing to its modest scale and detailing such as the Flemish bond brick work, minimal openings, soldier coursing and symmetry.

The neighbouring listed buildings have rather grand yet simple principal elevations which front on to Winterbrook and although they are much larger than Montclair they share similar features including the central doorway and symmetrical openings.

The proposed extension would increase the prominence of Montclair within the street scene and would introduce features that are not characteristic of the traditionally proportioned and detailed properties in this part of Winterbrook.

Your officers consider that the proposed development would detract from the setting of the adjacent listed buildings contrary to Policy CON5 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

6.4 **Impact on neighbours.** The occupants of Winterbrook House are concerned that the extended dwelling would block light from reaching their property and affect views from their dwelling. They are also concerned that the new windows to the north elevation would affect their privacy. Montclair is located at a distance of some 25 metres from Winterbrook House and the boundary between the properties comprises of mature trees and hedging providing a dense screen. Given the distance between the two properties and to the nature of the boundary treatment, your officers consider that the proposed extensions would not be unneighbourly or overbearing to the occupants of Winterbrook House.

6.5 **Parking and amenity.**

The extended property would have 4 bedrooms and require 3 off-road parking spaces. There is a dropped kerb at the front of the property which allows access to the garage and driveway which can accommodate at least 3 vehicles. The plot is an ample size with a garden area of approximately 3000 square metres. Both the parking and the garden size would therefore exceed the Council's standards.

7.0 **CONCLUSION**

7.1 There is no objection in principle to an extension to this property. However, it is considered that a subservient gable end extension would be more sympathetic to the character of the existing property. The proposed two storey extension with its inappropriate detailing is considered to be of a scale and form which dominates the existing dwelling to the detriment of the property itself and to the character of the area and the setting of neighbouring listed buildings.

8.0 **RECOMMENDATION**

8.1 **That planning permission be refused for the following reason:**

- 1. That having regard to the size, design and form of the existing property and to its location within a historic part of Winterbrook, the proposal to add a large and deep, two storey extension, of an over complicated and cluttered design, would be an unacceptable form of development, out of keeping with the character of the property. The proposal would therefore harm the character of the existing property and the street scene contrary to Policies G6, D1 and H13 of the South Oxfordshire Local Plan.**

- 2. That having regard to the location of Montclair within an historic part of Winterbrook and to the inappropriate form and detailing of the extension, the proposal would have a detrimental impact on the setting of neighbouring listed buildings contrary to Policy CON5 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.**

Author Miss G. Napier
Contact No. 01491 823282
Email Add. planning.west@southoxon.gov.uk