

Record of individual Cabinet member decision

Local Government Act 2000 and the Local Authorities (Executive Arrangements) (Meetings and Access to Information) (England) Regulations 2012

Decision made by	Councillor Sam James-Lawrie – Cabinet Member for Environment
Key decision?	Yes – as it incurs expenditure of more than £75,000.
Date of decision	02/12/2024
Name and job title of officer requesting the decision	William Piotrowski – Technical Services -Senior Engineer
Officer contact details	Tel: 07827 990426 Email: William.piotrowski@southandvale.gov.uk
Decision	To award a resurfacing works contract at Wallingford Cemetery to Hazell & Jefferies Ltd
Reasons for decision	<p>In conjunction with the Procurement officer and Legal, it was determined that the most appropriate contract was a Joint Contracts Tribunal (JCT) contract.</p> <p><u>Tender and Evaluation</u></p> <p>The contract procurement was an open tender on the southeast portal. The tender opportunity had 37 views in total, five decided to opt out of submitting a proposal and 21 after looking at the opportunity did not take it any further.</p> <p>Two of the tenders did not meet the Pass/Fail questions and were deemed non-compliant. The remaining nine compliant tenders were evaluated by the following team:</p> <p>William Piotrowski – Senior Engineer David Bell – Senior Engineer Des Porter – Parks Team Leader</p> <p>The quality of the returns were variable. Six of the tender returns demonstrated excellent quality, the remaining three raised concerns over the contractors ability to undertake the works required. Following individual evaluations the scores where amalgamated, this table shows the summary of the evaluation results.</p>

Rank	Contractor	Price (%)	Quality (%)	Combined total (%)
1	E	£126,612.26 (60)	40	100.00
2	G	£135,334.30 (56.13)	36	92.13
3	H	£152,044.89 (49.96)	38	87.96
4	C	£158,042.00 (48.07)	35	83.07
5	D	£168,104.49 (45.19)	34	79.19
6	A	£187,739.00 (40.46)	37	77.46
7	B	£179,324.43 (42.36)	21	63.36
8	I	£237,765.80 (31.95)	21	52.95
9	F	£222,899.91 (34.08)	18	52.08

The recommendation is to award the contract to Contractor E, Hazell & Jefferies Ltd, Mount Pleasant Farm, Coombe End, Whitchurch Hill, Pangbourne, Reading, Berkshire, RG8 7TB.

Alternative options rejected

Alternatives were considered in a detailed capital scheme appraisal report.

The Council has an obligation to maintain its cemeteries to prevent health and safety issues. As these are on Council owned land or land which the Council is responsible for repair of, they are liable for the financial improvements.

Officers considered carrying out individual pot hole repairs but the damage to the surface is extensive enough to warrant a more substantial scheme of reconstruction and would be more economically advantageous than continuous repair of smaller areas.

Climate and ecological implications

A climate impact assessment tool has been completed for these works. Slight or short-term negative impacts have been identified, linked to the construction phase of the project. Tenderers were required to detail the measures they are taking to tackle climate emergency, and weighting given to quality of submission for these actions. Use of permeable sub-bases and improved drainage will aid infiltration of surface water to ground and prevent surface water run-off from site.

Legal implications

The proposed contract value is not above the Find a tender threshold relating to contract procurement rules however does exceed £75,000. It is

	<p>proposed to enter into a contract using the JCT Standard Building Contract with Quantities as amended by legal services. Legal officers have provided a draft contract (as part of tender) which will require finalising.</p> <p>A copy of the tender evaluation attached at Appendix 1 showing weighted quality score (40 percent) and price (60 percent) has been made confidential as specified in part 1 of schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 and as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) Order 2006: para 2. information which is likely to reveal the identity of an individual; and para 3. information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information); as it includes competitive tender information.</p>
<p>Financial implications</p>	<p>The winning tender is £126,612.26 and includes £14,040 of contingency. This is considered value for money for the works proposed.</p> <p>There is £134,000 in capital budget A405. £9,431.40 of this budget has been spent at Kidmore End Cemetery, leaving a remaining working budget of £124,568.60.</p>
<p>Climate implications</p>	<p>As above</p>
<p>Equalities implications</p>	<p>Resurfacing will improve accessibility and safety of users of the cemetery, specifically the elderly and those using walking aids/wheelchairs.</p>
<p>Other implications</p>	<p><u>Archaeology</u></p> <p>As the site is located in an area of archaeological interest to the north of the Saxon defended town and medieval castle, advice was sought from Oxfordshire County Council Archaeology. Previous archaeological investigations undertaken at the Wallingford School site immediately to the west have recorded a late Neolithic/Early Bronze Age pit along with medieval pitting and quarrying. Further late Saxon and medieval pottery has also been recorded across the area. Whilst it is considered unlikely that the proposed works will impact upon any burials associated with the cemetery, it is possible that further archaeological remains related to the prehistoric and medieval settlement of the area could be disturbed by this development.</p> <p>Oxfordshire County Council therefore recommend that an archaeological monitoring and recording action (watching brief) be maintained during the period of construction.</p> <p><u>Footpath Closure</u></p> <p>The main access road is a public right of way. A Temporary Traffic Regulation Order application for a footpath closure has been made to Oxfordshire County Council. This has a minimum notice period of 12 weeks. This would mean earliest construction February 2025.</p>

Background papers considered	ICMD – transfer of capital scheme from provisional to approved programme.			
Declarations/ conflict of interest? Declaration of other councillor/ officer consulted by the Cabinet member?				
List consultees		Name	Outcome	Date
	Ward councillors	Katharine Keats-Rohan.	Excellent news that this work is going ahead. There has long been concern over these paths and quite a few complaints.	31/10/2024
		James Barlow	Glad that this work can go ahead now. Good to see the use of permeable sub-base materials and better drainage to improve the surface water issues on this site.	30/10/2024
	Legal legal@southandvale.gov.uk	Pat Connell	Agreed as amended	30/10/2024
	Finance Finance@southandvale.gov.uk	Damon Cotterill	I can confirm that the £134,000 budget is in place for scheme A405, with spend in year of £9,431,40. £2,043.66 shortfall between winning tender amount and working budget to be covered from Contingency budget (A800) – agreed with Anna Winship.	31/10/2024
	Climate and biodiversity climateaction@southandvale.gov.uk	Jessie Fieth	No comments to make	06/11/2024
	Diversity and equality equalities@southandvale.gov.uk	Lorne Grove	Following review as this is related to the contract there are no direct equities implication, so no additional comment at this stage	30/10/2024
	Procurement Procurement@southandvale.gov.uk	Ben Watson	Agreed	07/11/2024
	Human resources hadminandpayroll@southandvale.gov.uk		Nil response	06/11/2024
	Property property@southandvale.gov.uk	Karen Lister	Happy to agree to the award as I can see that Legal has provided advice in respect of the council's liabilities regarding the road which we	29/10/2024

			do not own.	
	Health and safety healthandsafety@southandvale.gov.uk	Andrew Huckstep	No comments to make	04/11/2024
	Property Assets Facilities@southandvale.gov.uk	Katie Preston	No comments to make	11/11/2024
	Risk and insurance risk@southandvale.gov.uk	Allison Holliday	The proposed course of action will reduce risk of injury to public due to trips and falls on uneven ground	31/10/2024
	Communications communications@southandvale.gov.uk	Peter Truman	No comments	30/10/2024
Confidential decision? If so, under which exempt category?	No			
Call-in waived by Scrutiny Committee chairman?	No			
Has this been discussed by Cabinet members?	No			
Cabinet portfolio holder's signature To confirm the decision as set out in this notice.	Signature _____ Sam James-Lawrie _____ Date _____ 02/12/24 _____			

ONCE SIGNED, THIS FORM MUST BE HANDED TO DEMOCRATIC SERVICES IMMEDIATELY.

For Democratic Services office use only		
Form received	Date: 03/12/2024	Time: 08.45
Date published to all councillors	Date: 03/12/2024	
Call-in deadline	Date: 10/12/2024	Time: 17.00

Appendix 1 – Tender Evaluation

Title: Wallingford Cemetery Resurfacing Works **Evaluator Name:** Moderated

		Compliant Bids										
Supplier		A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	Highest Quality	
Weighted Quality Score (40%)		37	21	35	34	40	18	36	38	21	40.00	
		93%	53%	88%	85%	100%	45%	90%	95%	53%		
Price		£ 187,739.00	£ 179,324.41	£ 158,042.00	£ 168,104.49	£ 126,612.26	£ 222,899.91	£ 135,334.30	£ 152,044.89	£ 237,765.80	Lowest Price	£ 126,612.26
adjusted price score (% of lowest)		0.67	0.71	0.80	0.75	1.00	0.57	0.94	0.83	0.53		
Weighted Cost Score (x 60%)		40.46	42.36	48.07	45.19	60.00	34.08	56.13	49.96	31.95		
Total weighted score		77.46	63.36	83.07	79.19	100.00	52.08	92.13	87.96	52.95		
Ranking		6	7	4	5	1	9	2	3	8		